

What drives intergenerational coresidence in India?

Esha Chatterjee and Frances Goldscheider

1. Introduction

In today's world with a decline in fertility and mortality levels and increased life expectancy, people are more likely to live till a very old age. A large body of research is being conducted on aging and related issues in developed countries. In developing countries too, issues linked to an increased old age dependency ratio are evolving. In India, fertility rates and mortality rates have declined over the past decades, although there is a lot of regional variation. Traditionally, Indian families were configured as joint families where husband and wife lived with their children and the husbands' parents and on many occasions with his siblings, aunts and uncles. However, over the years there have been increased instances of people living in nuclear families. It would be interesting to examine the reasons for this shift from joint to nuclear families. Particularly, it would be interested to examine the importance of factors such as educational level of the head of a household, ownership of farm/non-farm business by the family, area of residence and the educational level of the father of the household head in determining whether a family lives as a nuclear or a joint family. The present paper includes only those families where the fathers of the household head are alive. Also, household heads aged 30-60 are considered, as people belonging to this age group would be old enough to have their own career, and young enough to have fathers who are alive. This study would provide insights about which kind of people are more likely to take care of their parents in their old age.

a) Hypotheses about the decline in intergenerational co-residence in the global context

In USA a number of studies have been conducted on the reduction in intergenerational co-residence over the decades. Some of the hypotheses that have been generated to explain the cause of the decline in intergenerational co-residence are briefly discussed below. The affluence hypothesis, proposes that an increase in the wealth of the elderly, leads to their reduced dependence on children, and this leads to reduced intergenerational co-residence (Goldscheider et al 1998). Numerous studies have supported the fact that intergenerational co-residence often occurs because of the needs of the children rather than that of parents (Aquilino, 1990; Crimmins and Ingegneri 1990; Kotlikoff and Morris 1990; Ward, Logan, and Spitze 1992; cf. Moehling 1995; Choi 2003; Ruggles, 2007). The economic development hypothesis posits that the decline in intergenerational coresidence has occurred because of a decline in household production, an increase in wage labor and a rise in mass education. With economic development, people move away from family farms and other inheritable family businesses into doing wage work. Children who are educated are more likely to move away to Cities in order to seek opportunities. They are less likely to co-reside with elderly parents (Ruggles, 2007). Another hypothesis that was suggested by the mid twentieth social theorists, particularly the structural functionalists, was that an increase in social and geographical mobility due to demands of jobs associated with the new industrial system, led to an increase in nuclear families. However, new evidence in the USA indicated to the contrary that high economic and geographic mobility corresponded to high intergenerational co-

residence. (Hall and Ruggles, 2004; Ferrie, 2005; Ruggles, 2007). It was also hypothesized that urbanization leads to a decline in the importance of families by performing some of the functions of joint families such as provision of social support, education etc. This view that smaller nuclear families would be supported by the style of living in Cities was supported by mid twentieth century social theory (Burgess 1960; Goode 1963; Cowgill, 1974; Cited from Ruggle 2007). However, historical proof seems to go against this hypothesis. The final two hypotheses that explain the causes for the decline in levels of co-residence are demographic changes, and changes in attitudes. Demographic changes or a decline in fertility would imply that older people would have fewer children with whom they can co-reside; this in turn would reflect in a decline in the percentage of elderly living with their children. (Kobrin, 1976; Soldo, 1981; Wister and Burch, 1983; Ruggles 2007). Finally attitudinal change, or changes in family values and a greater want of freedom by the youngsters has led to a decline in intergenerational co-residence. The present study looks to verify some of the hypothesis using cross-sectional data, in the Indian context.

b) Studies in the Indian context

It has been observed that in Asian countries most of the support and care for the elderly comes from the family (Martel and Carriere, 2003, Croll,2006). A study that used UNU survey data in seven developing countries identified India as one of the countries with maximum coresidence of elderly with their married children (Hashimoto, 1991).

In India filial piety is often cited as a reason why children are expected to care for their parents. In certain countries where patrilineal stems prevail, elderly prefer staying with sons (Truong et al, 1997; Ofstedal et al, 1999; Aykan and Wolf, 2000; Ogawa and Retherford, 1997; Mason, 1992; Yount, 2005; Shah et al ,2002; Golandaj et al, 2013). This is the case in India. In general in India sons are expected to care of their parents and are more likely to coreside with them; this is different from the scenario in western society (Bongaarts and Zimmer, 2001; Chaudhury, 2004; Gulati and Rajan, 1990; De Silva, 1994; Zachariah, 2001; Panigrahi, 2009 ; Jadhav et al, 2013).

Using data from the National Family and Health Survey 1992-1993, Rajan and Kumar (2003) find that only 6% of elderly were living in families where their immediate kins were absent. The economic security of the elderly in such a situation emerges as an issue.

Despite the pre-dominance of joint families in India, there has been a decline in the traditional family structure over the years, due to various reasons such as rural to urban migration by youngsters, change in values etc. (Bhattacharya, 2005; Mason, 1992; Rajan et al, 2000; Sahayam, 1988; Shah, 1999; Sumangala, 2003; Panigrahi , 2009). Sathyanarayana *et al.* (*forthcoming*, 2012) use the National Family Health Survey (NFHS) data from 1992-93 and 2005-06, and find that around three fourths of the elderly stay with their spouses and/or children and their grandchildren, over the survey years.

The number of nuclear families is growing. The family structure in India is experiencing some change. (Rajan and Kumar 2003, Arokiasamy et al,2012, Jadhav et al, 2013).

Around 7.6% of India's population is above the age of 60 (Krishnaswamy et al,

2008). The number of elderly people in India is growing over the years. (Rajan, et al, 2000; Alam and Mukherjee, 2005; Gulati and Rajan, 1990; Sengupta and Agree, 2003; NSSO, 1998; Panigrahi 2009). It is known that the older segment of the population in India have to face a variety of problems due to a lack of financial and familial support and inadequate healthcare services. The Government is looking to provide many facilities for the elderly such as healthcare services, old age homes amongst others. The study of aging is relatively new in India and a lot of questions are still to be answered. It would thus be interesting to examine the types of people (based on ownership of farms or businesses, education level, area of residence etc.) who would be more likely to coreside with their children.

Many of the earlier studies on living arrangements in India have been concentrated to a particular region (Sudha, et al, 2006; Panigrahi, 2009) or been a combination of a few States (Jadhav, 2013). IHDS (2011-12) would provide an opportunity to conduct the analysis using a sample representative of the whole of India. It is an extensive and in depth survey that covers family related questions in details.

3. Hypothesis

Five main hypotheses in the present study are:

Hypothesis 1: Sons are more likely to coreside with fathers in case the family owns a farm compared to a situation where the family doesn't own a farm.

Hypothesis 2: Sons are more likely to coreside with fathers in case the family owns a business compared to a situation where the family doesn't own a business.

The above two hypothesis are formulated on the basis of the economic development hypothesis. (Ruggles, 2007). With economic development as production at the household level declines, people would be more likely to seek education, wage labor also increases. This would lead to a decline in intergenerational coresidence.

However, in instances where household level production still exist (cases where families own farms or businesses) sons might be more likely to coreside with their fathers. In case the above hypotheses are rejected, it would mean that there is no difference in coresidence patterns between those people whose families who own farms or businesses compared to those who don't. This would imply that in spite of household production opportunities being present, sons might be more ambitious and they might be seeking better quality outside jobs.

Hypothesis 3: Sons who reside in rural areas and do not own farms and those sons who stay in urban areas are less likely to coreside with fathers compared to those who stay in rural areas and own farms.

In a rural setup, the society is more traditional and thus, families are often more extended compared to urban societies, where there might be a greater prevalence of nuclear families. (Panigrahi, 2009). The above hypothesis would help examine whether there is any difference between coresidence patterns between rural and urban societies. In case there is no significant difference between coresidence patterns in rural farm families and rural non-farm families, while there is a significant difference between rural farm families and urban families, then it could be said that the differences between coresidence patterns in rural and urban areas is because of differences in the traditions in the rural and urban society. However, if there is a

significant difference in coresidence patterns between rural farms and rural non-farms than the difference between coresidence patterns between rural and urban areas could be because of ownership of farms rather than differences in traditions in the society.

Hypothesis 4: Sons will be less likely to stay with fathers, the higher the level of education of the father.

As discussed in the earlier sections affluence hypothesis is an important determinant of the decline in intergenerational coresidence. (Goldscheider and Lawton 1998)

The number of years of education has a strong correlation with wealth, and it also has an independent positive impact on the choice of preferring to live alone. (Kan et al, 2001). With an increase in educational level of the elderly coresidence is observed to decline. (Andrade and DeVos, 2002; Bongaarts and Zimmer 2001; Pal, 2004; Zimmer, Hermalin and Lin, 2001, Panigrahi, 2009). If the above hypothesis holds true it would imply that intergenerational coresidence is more due to the sons' need rather than a fathers' need. However, if no support is found for hypothesis 4 then it would mean that coresidence patterns are not affected by educational level of the fathers.

Hypothesis 5: The greater the level of education of the son, the less likely will he be to coreside with his father.

The level of education is connected to the level of wealth, it also has an independent positive impact on the choice of preferring to live alone. (Kan et al, 2001)
If the above hypothesis holds true it would imply that intergenerational coresidence is more due to the fathers' need rather than a sons' need. However, if no support is found for hypothesis 5 then it would mean that coresidence patterns are not affected by educational level of the sons.

4. Data Source

The data source that we are planning to work with is India Human Development Survey (2011-12). India Human Development Survey (IHDS) 2004-2005 is a nationally representative sample of 41,554 households, spread across all the States and Union Territories of India (other than Andaman Nicobar and Lakshadweep), 384 districts, 1503 villages and 971 urban blocks. 215,754 individuals are included within these 41,554 households. IHDS 2011-12 reinterviews these households. The household questionnaires were mostly answered by the head of the household, who knew about the income, expenditure etc of the household (often a man). There were questionnaires on health and education, which were answered by women. The IHDS has collected data on income, consumption, employment, education, access to mass media, fertility history, caste, religion, etc.

5. Variables used in the study

a) Dependent Variable

The dependent variable looks at whether a married male household head in the age group of 30-60 coresides with his father.

The household roster consists of information on all those who live under the same roof and share the same kitchen for 6+ months during last year. The household

questionnaire accounts for cases where a parent is outside of home for more than 6 months or if the parent is dead. In the present study only those people are considered whose fathers are alive. In the present study if the father co-resides with the head of the household (the son) then the value of the variable intergenerational coresidence=1, otherwise the variable takes a value of zero.

b) Independent Variables

The main independent variables in the present study are education levels of the father and the son (takes a value of 0-15, 0=illiterate ..15=college graduate), area of residence (dummy variables for urban, rural non-farm, the reference being rural farm) presence of family farm, presence of family business. Some of the important controls would be variables on age and activity status (controls for the health of the father), controls for the major States of India (accounting for the regional variation within India), controls for religion (dummy variables are created for Muslim and other religions, hindus being the reference group), caste (dummy variables are created for each of the backward castes i.e. the scheduled castes (SC), the scheduled tribes (ST) and the other backward castes (OBC) ; the reference group being those belonging to the forward castes) and marital status (currently married versus other).

References

- Alam, Moneer; Mukherjee, Mukta. "Ageing, Activities of Daily Living Disabilities and the need for Public Health Initiatives: Some Evidence from a Household Survey in India." *Asia Pacific Population Journal*, 2005; 20.2:pp. 47-76.
- Andrade, Flavia Cristina; De Vos Susan. "An analysis of living arrangements among elderly women in Brazil." *Encontro Nacional De Estudos Populacionais* 2002: 14.
- Arokiasamy P; Bloom David; Lee Jinkook; Feeney Kevin; Ozolins Marija. "Longitudinal Aging Study in India: Vision, Design, Implementation, and Preliminary Findings." In: National Research Council (US) Panel on Policy Research and Data Needs to Meet the Challenge of Aging in Asia; Smith JP; Majumdar M, editors. *Aging in Asia: Findings From New and Emerging Data Initiatives*. Washington (DC): National Academies Press (US); 2012.
- Aquilino, William S. "The Likelihood of Parent-Child Coresidence: Effects of Family Structure and Parental Characteristics." *Journal of Marriage and the Family*. 1990; 52:405–19.
- Aykan, Hakan; Wolf, Douglas A. "Traditionality, Modernity, and Household Composition Parent-Child Coresidence in Contemporary Turkey." *Research on Aging* 2000; 22.4: 395-421.
- Bhattacharya, Prakash. "Implications of an Aging Population in India: Challenges and Opportunities." *The Living to 100 and Beyond Symposium* 2005: 1-40.
- Bongaarts, John; Zimmer, Zachary. "Living Arrangements of Older Adults in the Developing World: An Analysis of DHS Household Survey." *Working Paper, No. 148. Population Research Division, Population Council* 2001.
- Burgess, Ernest W. "Family Structure and Relationships." In: Burgess, EW., editor. *Aging in Western Societies*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press; 1960. p. 271-98.
- Chaudhury, Rafiqul Huda. "Ageing in Nepal." *Asia Pacific Population Journal*, 2004;19.1: pp. 61-80.
- Choi, Namkee G. "Coresidence Between Unmarried Aging Parents and their Adult Children—Who Moved in With Whom and Why?" *Research on Aging*. 2003; 25:384–404.
- Cowgill, Donald O. "The Aging of Populations and Societies." *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*. 1974; 415:1–18.
- Crimmins, Eileen M.; Ingegneri, Dominique G. "Interaction and Living Arrangements of Older Parents and their Children." *Research on Aging*. 1990; 12:3–35.
- Croll, Elisabeth J. "The intergenerational contract in the changing Asian family." *Oxford Development Studies* 2006;34.4: 473-491.

- De Silva, W Indralal. "How Serious is Aging in Sri Lanka and What can be done about it?" *Asia Pacific Population Journal*, 1994; 9.1: pp. 19 -36.
- Ferrie, Joseph P. "The End of American Exceptionalism? Mobility in the U.S. Since 1850." *Journal of Economic Perspectives*. 2005; 19:199–215.
- Golandaj, Javeed Ahamed A.; Goli Srinivas; Das, Kailash Chandra. "Living Arrangements among Older Population and Perceptions on Old Age Assistance among Adult Population in India." *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy* 2013. 33.5/6: 7-7.
- Goldscheider, Frances K.; Lawton, Leora. "Family Experiences and the Erosion of Support for Intergenerational Coresidence." *Journal of Marriage and the Family*. 1998; 60:623–32.
- Goode, William J. *World Revolution and Family Patterns*. Glencoe, IL: Free Press; 1963.
- Gulati, S C; Rajan, S Irudaya. "Social and Economic Implications of Population Aging in Kerala, India." *Demography India*, 1990; 19.2, pp. 235-50.
- Hall, Patricia Kelly; Ruggles, Steven. " 'Restless in the Midst of their Prosperity': New Evidence of the Internal Migration Patterns of Americans, 1850–1990." *Journal of American History*. 2004; 91:829–46.
- Hashimoto, Akiko. "Living arrangements of the aged in seven developing countries: A preliminary analysis." *Journal of Cross-Cultural Gerontology* 1991; 6.4: 359-381.
- Jadhav Apoorva; Sathyanarayana K.M.; Kumar Sanjay; James K.S. "Living Arrangements of the Elderly in India: Who lives alone and what are the patterns of familial support?" *Annual Meeting of The Population Association of America* 2013.
- Kan, Kamhon; Park Albert; Chang, Ming-cheng. "A dynamic model of elderly living arrangements in Taiwan." *Unpublished manuscript, University of Michigan* 2001.
- Kobrin, Frances E. "The Fall in Household Size and the Rise of the Primary Individual in the United States." *Demography*. 1976; 13:127–38.
- Kotlikoff, Laurence J.; Morris, John N. "Why Don't the Elderly Live with Their Children? A New Look." In: Wise, DA. editor. *Issues in the Economics of Aging*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press; 1990. p. 149-69.
- Krishnaswamy, B.; Sein, U. Than; Munodawafa, Davison; Varghese Cherian; Venkataraman Kavita; Anand Leslie. "Ageing in India." *Ageing International* 32, no. 4 (2008): 258-268.
- Martel, Laurent; Carriere, Yves. "Descriptive analysis of the effects of marital dissolution on living arrangements of older persons: the Canadian case and an

international comparison.” *Genus* 2003: 137-167.

Mason, Karen Oppenheim. “Family change and support of the elderly in Asia: What do we know?” *Asia-Pacific population journal/United Nations* 1992; 7.3: 13.

Moehling, Carolyn. *PhD dissertation. Department of Economics, Northwestern University*; Evanston, IL: 1995. “Work and Family: Intergenerational Support in American Families, 1880–1920.”

NSSO (1998). “The Aged in India: A Socio-Economic Profile, 52nd Round”, Report No. 446, National Sample Survey Organisation, New Delhi.

Ofstedal, Mary Beth; Knodel, John; Chayovan, Napaporn. “Intergenerational support and gender: A comparison of four Asian countries.” *Southeast Asian Journal of Social Science*, 1999; 27.2: 21-41.

Ogawa, Naohiro; Robert D. Retherford. “Shifting costs of caring for the elderly back to families in Japan: will it work?” *Population and Development Review* 1997; 23.1:59-94.

Pal, Sarmistha. “Do children act as old age security in rural India? Evidence from an analysis of elderly living arrangements.” *Cardiff Business School, Column Drive*.

Panigrahi, Akshaya, Kumar. “Determinants of Living Arrangements of Elderly in Orissa: An Analysis.” Bangalore, India: Institute for Social and Economic Change, 2009.

Rajan, S Irudaya; Mishra U S; Sarma P Sankar. “Ageing in India.” *Indian Social Science Review*, 2000; 2.1: pp.1-48.

Rajan, S Irudaya; Kumar, Sanjay. “Living Arrangement among Indian Elderly: Evidences from National Family Health Survey.” *Economic and Political Weekly*, 2003; 38.1:pp 75-80.

Ruggles, Steven. “The decline of intergenerational coresidence in the United States, 1850 to 2000.” *American Sociological Review* 2007; 72.6: 964-89.

Sahayam, M Deva. “Aged Females: The Most Deprived Among the Deprived.” *The Indian Journal of Social Work*, 1988; XLIX. 3: pp.261 -269.

Sathyanarayana K.M.; Kumar Sanjay; James K.S. “Living Arrangements of Elderly in India: Policy and Programmatic Implications” (2012, forthcoming)

Schafer, R. “Determinants of Living Arrangements of the Elderly, 1999” ;*W* 99-6, *Joint Centre for Housing Studies, Harvard University*.

Shah, AM. “Changes in the Family and Elderly.” *Economic and Political Weekly*, 1999; 34.20: pp. 1179-82.

Shah, Nasra M.; Yount, Kathryn M.; Shah Makhdoom A.; Menon Indu. "Living arrangements

of older women and men in Kuwait." *Journal of cross-cultural gerontology* 2002; 17.4: 337-355.

Soldo, Beth J. "The Living Arrangements of the Elderly in the Near Future." In: Kiesler, SB.; Morgan, JN.; Oppenheimer, VK., editors. *Aging: Social Change*. New York: Academic Press; 1981. p.491-512.

Sudha, S.; Suchindran Chirayath; Mutran, Elizabeth J.; Rajan S. Irudaya; Sarma, P. Sankara. "Marital status, family ties, and self-rated health among elders in South India." *Journal of cross-cultural gerontology* 2006; 21.3-4: 103-120.

Sumangala, PR. "Retired People and Their Participation in Family Activities." *Man in India*, 2003; 83.1: pp. 221-25.

Truong, Si Anh; Bui T. C.; Goodkind Daniel; Knodel John. "Living arrangements, patrilineality and sources of support among elderly Vietnamese." *Asia-Pacific population journal/United Nations*, 1997; 12.4: 69.

Van Solinge, Hanna. "Living arrangements of non-married elderly people in the Netherlands in 1990." *Ageing and Society* 1994; 14.02: 219-236.

Velkoff, Victoria A. "Living Arrangement and Well being of Older Population: Future Research Direction." *Population Bulletin of the United Nations*, 2001; 42.43: pp 376-385.

Ward, Russell; Logan, John; Spitze, Glenna. "The Influence of Parent and Child Needs on Coresidence in Middle and Later Life." *Journal of Marriage and the Family* 1992; 54:209-21.

Wister AV; Burch Thomas K. "Fertility and Household Status of Older Women in Canada, 1921." *Canadian Studies in Population*. 1983; 10:1-13.

Yount, Kathryn M. "The patriarchal bargain and intergenerational coresidence in Egypt." *The Sociological Quarterly* 2005; 46.1: 137-164.

Zachariah, K. C. "Coping with demographic transition." *Economic and Political Weekly* 2001; 36.22:1938-1940.

Zimmer, Zachary; Hermalin, Albert I; Lin Hui-Sheng "Whose Education Counts? The Impact of Grown Children's Education on the Physical Functioning of Their Parents in Taiwan." *Policy Research Division Working Paper, No. 146*. New York: Population Council. 2001.